



STATE OF MICHIGAN
BUREAU OF ELECTIONS
LANSING

May 23, 2022

REVIEW OF NOMINATING PETITION

JOHN MICHAEL MALONE
Nonpartisan Candidate for 3rd Circuit Judge, Non-Incumbent Position

NUMBER OF VALID SIGNATURES REQUIRED: 4,000 signatures.

TOTAL FILING: 6,947 signatures.

RESULT OF FACE REVIEW: 1,348 valid signatures, 5,599 invalid signatures.

| | | |
|---|-------|-------|
| Total number of signatures filed | | 6,947 |
| Jurisdiction errors (no city in county known by name given by signer, dual jurisdiction entry, jurisdiction name given by signer does not align with address) | Less: | 8 |
| Address errors (no street address or rural route given) | Less: | 2 |
| Circulator errors (circulator did not sign or date petition, etc.) | Less: | 10 |
| Signature errors (no signature or incomplete signature) | Less: | 13 |
| Number of signatures on sheets submitted by fraudulent-petition circulators | Less: | 5,566 |
| TOTAL | | 1,348 |

Staff reviewed each petition sheet submitted by Mr. Malone. During that review, staff flagged each sheet which was signed by a fraudulent-petition circulator. For additional information on sheets submitted by fraudulent-petition circulators, see *Staff Report on Fraudulent Nominating Petitions*.

In total, staff's review of Mr. Malone's petition sheets identified 5,599 invalid signatures and 1,348 facially valid signatures, which dropped him below the 4,000 signature threshold and rendered him ineligible for the ballot.

Signatures from the following fraudulent-petition circulators were included in Mr. Malone's submission:

| | |
|------------------|----------------|
| Davon Best | 237 signatures |
| Antonio Braxton | 185 signatures |
| Nicholas Carlton | 732 signatures |
| DeShawn Evans | 268 signatures |

| | |
|------------------|-------------------------|
| Jehvon Evans | 151 signatures |
| Corey Hampton | 183 signatures |
| Jonell Hampton | 201 signatures |
| LeVaughn Hearn | 157 signatures |
| Danyil Lancaster | 435 signatures |
| Ryan Snowden | 710 signatures |
| Stephen Tinnin | 594 signatures |
| Diallo Vaughn | 80 signatures |
| Yazmine Vasser | 217 signatures |
| William Williams | 1,416 signatures |
| | <u>5,566 signatures</u> |

In addition to issues common with fraudulent-petition circulators in general, staff identified specific factors in this petition set. First, in several sheets circulated by Stephen Tinnin, numerous voters listed their jurisdiction as “Brownstone Township” rather than the actual name, “Brownstown.” In several instances, the names of the voters themselves were also misspelled:

INSTRUCTIONS ON REVERSE SIDE

NOMINATING PETITION

(COUNTYWIDE NONPARTISAN)

The "Countywide" Nonpartisan Petition form may be used by any nonpartisan candidate. Exceptions: the form may not be used by a candidate who seeks a school board position, intermediate school board position, community college trustee position, library board position or a district library board position.

We, the undersigned, registered and qualified voters of the County of Wayne and State of Michigan, nominate John Michael Malone (Name of Candidate) as a candidate for the office of Circuit Court Judge - Regular Term - Non-Incumbent Position / January 1, 2029 (Title of Office/Term Expiration Date).

871 Grand Marais (Street Address or Rural Route) Grosse Pointe Park (City or Township) 3rd Circuit (District, if any) to be voted for at the Primary Election to be held on the 2nd day of August, 2022. 518

WARNING - A PERSON WHO KNOWINGLY SIGNS MORE PETITIONS FOR THE SAME OFFICE THAN THERE ARE PERSONS TO BE ELECTED TO THE OFFICE, SIGNS A PETITION MORE THAN ONCE, OR SIGNS A NAME OTHER THAN HIS OR HER OWN IS VIOLATING THE PROVISIONS OF THE MICHIGAN ELECTION LAW.

| Signature | Printed Name | Street Address or Rural Route | Name of City or Township | Zip Code | DATE OF SIGNING Month Day Year |
|-------------------------|------------------|-------------------------------|--------------------------|----------|-----------------------------------|
| <i>Mark Stewart</i> | mark stewart | 32018 Short St | Brownstone | 48227 | 4 12 22 |
| <i>Angeline Kelling</i> | Angeline Kelling | 21921 71st Dr | Harper Woods | 48225 | 4 12 22 |
| <i>Arthur Desmond</i> | Arthur Desmond | 7 Knaysr | Ecorse | 48209 | 4 12 22 |
| <i>Robert Ware</i> | Robert Ware | 29989 Windsor | Brownstone | 48229 | 4 12 22 |
| <i>Gregory Jempton</i> | Gregory Jempton | 20210 Hollywood | Harper Woods | 48225 | 4 12 22 |
| <i>Dillie Robinson</i> | Dillie Robinson | 423 Daniel Ave | Westland | 48186 | 4 12 22 |
| <i>Victor Lee</i> | Victor Lee | 30748 Barrington St | Westland | 48186 | 4 12 22 |
| <i>Jason Stafford</i> | Jason Stafford | 20220 Frolywood | Harper Woods | 48225 | 4 12 22 |
| <i>Thomas Campbell</i> | Thomas Campbell | 32273 Teuman Ro | Brownstone | 48229 | 4 12 22 |

CERTIFICATE OF CIRCULATOR

The undersigned circulator of the above petition asserts that he or she is 18 years of age or older and a United States citizen; that each signature on the petition was signed in his or her presence; that he or she has neither caused nor permitted a person to sign the petition more than once and has no knowledge of a person signing the petition more than once; and that, to his or her best knowledge and belief, each signature is the genuine signature of the person purporting to sign the petition, the person signing the petition was at the time of signing a registered elector of the City or Township indicated preceding the signature, and the elector was qualified to sign the petition.

Q If the circulator is not a resident of Michigan, the circulator shall make a cross [X] or check mark [V] in the box provided, otherwise each signature on this petition sheet is invalid and the signatures will not be counted by a filing official. By making a cross or check mark in the box provided, the undersigned circulator asserts that he or she is not a resident of Michigan and agrees to accept the jurisdiction of this state for the purpose of any legal proceeding or hearing that concerns a petition sheet executed by the circulator and agrees that legal process served on the Secretary of State or a designated agent of the Secretary of State has the same effect as if personally served on the circulator.

WARNING - A CIRCULATOR KNOWINGLY MAKING A FALSE STATEMENT IN THE ABOVE CERTIFICATE, A PERSON NOT A CIRCULATOR WHO SIGNS AS A CIRCULATOR, OR A PERSON WHO SIGNS A NAME OTHER THAN HIS OR HER OWN AS CIRCULATOR IS GUILTY OF A MISDEMEANOR.

CIRCULATOR — DO NOT SIGN OR DATE CERTIFICATE UNTIL AFTER CIRCULATING PETITION.

Stephen Tinnin
(Signature of Circulator)
Stephen Tinnin
(Printed Name of Circulator)
4905 Teaman Rd
(Complete Residence Address [Street and Number or Rural Route]) - [Do not enter a post office box]
Wayne MI 48397
(City or Township, State, Zip Code)

(County of Registration, if Registered to Vote, of a Circulator who is not a Resident of Michigan)

Form Approved by the Director of Elections, State of Michigan
www.PrintingSystems.us (800) 95-12345 (R 10/19) FORM #408

This substitution of “Brownstone” for “Brownstown” was identified across dozens of sheets and hundreds of signatures.

Additionally, consistent with other drives, staff verified that several of the purported signers had either not lived at the address listed on the petition for several years or had been cancelled with several appearing on one sheet:

INSTRUCTIONS ON REVERSE SIDE

NOMINATING PETITION

(COUNTYWIDE NONPARTISAN)

The "Countywide" Nonpartisan Petition form may be used by any nonpartisan candidate. Exceptions: the form may not be used by a candidate who seeks a school board position, intermediate school board position, community college trustee position, library board position or a district library board position.

We, the undersigned, registered and qualified voters of the County of Wayne and State of Michigan, nominate **John Michael Malone** (Name of Candidate)

871 Grand Marais Grosse Pointe Park as a candidate for the office of Circuit Court Judge - Regular Term - Non-Incumbent Position / January 1, 2029 (Title of Office/Term Expiration Date)

(Street Address or Rural Route) (City or Township)

3rd Circuit to be voted for at the Primary Election to be held on the 2nd day of August, 2022. 622

WARNING - A PERSON WHO KNOWINGLY SIGNS MORE PETITIONS FOR THE SAME OFFICE THAN THERE ARE PERSONS TO BE ELECTED TO THE OFFICE, SIGNS A PETITION MORE THAN ONCE, OR SIGNS A NAME OTHER THAN HIS OR HER OWN IS VIOLATING THE PROVISIONS OF THE MICHIGAN ELECTION LAW.

| Signature | Printed Name | Street Address or Rural Route | Name of City or Township | Zip Code | DATE OF SIGNING Month Day Year |
|-------------------------|------------------|-------------------------------|--------------------------|----------|---------------------------------------|
| <i>John Vitale</i> | John Vitale | 1709 Thrift Dr | Canton | 48188 | 04 10 22 |
| <i>Lynn Lam</i> | Lynn Lam | 39208 Forest Creek Dr | Westland | 48185 | 4 10 22 |
| <i>Kenneth Coats</i> | Kenneth Coats | 1351 Middlebelt Rd | Inkster | 48141 | 4 10 22 |
| <i>Bertha Wiggins</i> | Bertha Wiggins | 41626 Dianne St | Canton | 48188 | 4 10 22 |
| <i>Sare Leschke</i> | Sare Leschke | 1045 Palmer St | Plymouth | 48170 | 4 10 22 |
| <i>Keesa Bunn</i> | Keesa Bunn | 13437 Spencer St | Southgate | 48195 | 4 10 22 |
| <i>Elmer Zimmerman</i> | Elmer Zimmerman | 5135 Gloria St | Wayne | 48184 | 04 10 22 |
| <i>Charise Anderson</i> | Charise Anderson | 50368 Scarborough Dr | Canton | 48188 | 4 10 22 |
| <i>Chayon McDaniel</i> | Chayon McDaniel | 15690 Court Village Ln | Taylor | 48180 | 4 10 22 |
| <i>Noima Randolph</i> | Noima Randolph | 42477 Blackstone Ct | Canton | 48181 | 4 10 22 |

CERTIFICATE OF CIRCULATOR

The undersigned circulator of the above petition asserts that he or she is 18 years of age or older and a United States citizen; that each signature on this petition sheet is valid and the signatures will not be counted by a filing official. By making a cross or check mark in the box provided, the undersigned circulator asserts that he or she is not a resident of Michigan and agrees to accept the jurisdiction of this state for the purpose of any legal proceeding or hearing that concerns a petition sheet executed by the circulator and agrees that legal process served on the Secretary of State or a designated agent of the Secretary of State has the same effect as if personally served on the circulator.

☒ If the circulator is not a resident of Michigan, the circulator shall make a cross (X) or check mark (V) in the box provided, otherwise each signature on this petition sheet is invalid and the signatures will not be counted by a filing official.

WARNING - A CIRCULATOR KNOWINGLY MAKING A FALSE STATEMENT IN THE ABOVE CERTIFICATE, A PERSON NOT A CIRCULATOR WHO SIGNS AS A CIRCULATOR, OR A PERSON WHO SIGNS A NAME OTHER THAN HIS OR HER OWN AS CIRCULATOR IS GUILTY OF A MISDEMEANOR.

CIRCULATOR — DO NOT SIGN OR DATE CERTIFICATE UNTIL AFTER CIRCULATING PETITION.

(Signature of Circulator) *Jeffrey David Hillman* 4/10/22 (Date)

(Printed Name of Circulator) Jeffrey David Hillman

(Complete Residence Address (Street and Number or Rural Route)) • (Do not enter a post office box) 7022 Laurel Dr

(City or Township, State, Zip Code) Wayne Michigan 48188

(County of Registration, if Registered to Vote, of a Circulator who is not a Resident of Michigan) Wayne

Form Approved by the Director of Elections, State of Michigan
 www.PrintingSystems.us (800) 95-12345 (R 10/19) FORM #406

The individuals on lines 3, 4, and 9 were all cancelled 2017, 2018 and 2021 respectively.

Notably, on the above petition sheet, line 8 was purportedly signed by Charise Anderson. Ms. Anderson is Mr. Malone's challenger in the primary election. The signature purporting to belong to Ms. Anderson does not match Ms. Anderson's signature in the Qualified Voter File or on the Affidavit of Identity Ms. Anderson filed with the Bureau.

CHALLENGE: Jeffrey David Hillman challenged the nominating petitions submitted by Mr. Malone, alleging that 5,890 signatures across 620 petition sheets were invalid. Mr. Hillman challenged sheets circulated by Davon Best, Antonio Braxton, Nicholas Carlton, Jehvon Evans, Corey Hampton, Jonell Hampton, LeVaughn Hearn, Danyil Lancaster, Ryan Snowden, Stephen Tinnin, Diallo Vaughn, Yazmine Vasser, and William Williams as fraudulent. The challenge was not processed, because the circulators challenged by Mr. Hillman were the same circulators the staff had already identified as fraudulent-petition circulators in its own review. Mr. Hillman also challenged signatures circulated by William Buchanan, Aida Burns, Diana Curry, Adam Herrell, Leslie Holpe, and Kevin Wiley. Challenges to these sheets were not processed, because the staff had already determined that Mr. Malone did not meet the threshold for certification to the ballot based on the staff's initial review.

Mr. Malone responded to the challenge, alleging that the challenge was insufficiently precise and that no statutory basis exists to level challenges against a circulator's fraudulent activity in lieu of a challenge against the genuineness of individual signatures.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION: Determine petition insufficient.